

Truck committee recommendation 12/17/23

The truck committee reviewed four proposals for bid received December 7 and opened December 8, 2023

Prices were for meeting basic specifications as set forth in the bid requirement documents and may not include optional or alternative equipment such as independent front suspension which was requested to be provided if available. The bids were as follows:

- E-One \$1,046,079.00 Build time 1180 days (36-40 months)
- Sutphen \$1,234,280.47 Build time 28-33 months
- KME \$878,630 Build time 870 days (26-28 months)
- Pierce \$1,065,560 Build time 45-48 months

After reviewing bids, we assigned a different bid binder to each member of the committee and reviewed for accuracy to the bid requests and variances to the bid specifications, hidden costs, etc. We then met over several meetings to discuss the benefits and detractions offered by each bidder. During the bid review process we were informed that due to new 2027 Emissions regulations, the preferred engine manufacturer, Cummins has not yet produced an engine to meet the new requirements, and therefore engine cost and transmission selection and cost are open ended. This has the potential to add to the cost over the agreed upon price later in the build cycle (2-3 years). We also were informed of a new NFPA requirement that all Fire apparatus manufactured after January 1, 2024 must include stability control. Not all bids submitted included Stability control so this could be an additional cost for some vendors. Summary is as follows.

Sutphen:

- Was the highest bid of the four manufacturers.
- Builds a quality vehicle with good fit and finish.
- Brought a new apparatus to us for demonstration ride and inspection.
- Does not offer an Independent front suspension option.
- Bid offered did not include some of the design features requested such as a landing at the back top of truck and pool type ladder for hose bed access.
- Closest heavy maintenance service area is Utica NY. (125 miles one-way)
- Stability Control is included in bid.
- Bid specified Cummins X10 motor but would have the same issues meeting 2027 emissions. Potential price increase based on future engine development by Cummins to meet emissions standards.

KME

- Was the lowest bid.
- Did not bring an apparatus for us to view in person, however our current mini-pumper 752 is a KME.
- Bid generally met all requirements but used a Cummins L9 which does not meet 2027 emissions.
- With desired options, including independent front suspension , and with estimated engine and transmission upgrade costs from KME based on an X12 engine and Allison 4000 ES transmission cause the estimated cost rose to \$972,001 including stability control.

- Bid specifies final engine and transmission cost to be borne by buyer based on future engine development by Cummins to meet emissions standards.
- Closest heavy maintenance service area is Elma NY. (70 miles one-way)

E- One

- Arranged visits to three different area firehouses to view apparatus.
- Good fit and finish.
- Some on the committee felt the drivers seat area was cramped by the size of the engine cover (doghouse)
- Bid generally met all requirements. But did not include some features such as a swiveling siren control, a landing at the back top of truck and pool type ladder for hose bed access. Discussion about some of these being added after construction.
- Hard suction hose placement was on top of the truck, making quick and easy access difficult.
- Price of \$1,046,079.00 includes Independent Front Suspension and Stability Control.
- Cummins X12 engine specified but would have the same issues meeting emissions so a potential price increase is likely based on future engine development by Cummins to meet emissions standards.
- Closest heavy maintenance facility is Syracuse or Hamburg NY (85 miles one-way)

Pierce

- We have had a 30- year relationship with Pierce and currently 712 and 711 are Pierce apparatus.
- Bid generally met all requirements with the exception the spec included some compartments full depth resulting in a slightly higher cost than we need.
- Stability control will be added at no extra charge.
- Pierce offered the alternative of a Paccar engine, a Kenworth, Peterbilt and DAF product,
- Paccar motor is currently in production, more powerful than that specified, meets 2027 emissions requirements, and comes at a cost reduction compared to the Cummins.
- With the Paccar engine, independent front suspension option and split depth compartments as requested, the cost is \$1,074,560.00.
- The closest heavy maintenance facility is in Churchville (37 miles) and Leroy (43 miles).

Based on a thorough review of the bids, the uncertainty surrounding the 2027 engine development and potential price increases, the committee recommends Pierce as the builder for the new 712 due to the close adherence to the specs we provided, and the stability offered by the Paccar engine alternative. We have had good experience with Firematic (Churchville Fire Equipment) handling our warranty, maintenance, and follow up to any repair issues.

We propose to pay \$725,000 for the vehicle from capital reserves, and finance \$349,560 over a ten year period at the best rate available.